

Presentation evaluations

<i>Group presentation</i>	<i>Feedback</i>	<i>Outcome</i>
AS. Roma	<p><i>General comment</i> Quite long presentation of the problem but limited discussion of the ethical dilemma behind it. Despite the solution offered is reasonable is not well explained in terms of ethical consequences. The ethical discussion is not completely clear to sustain the final solution. Nevertheless, the work is appreciable.</p> <p><i>Suggestion for the short essay</i> The ethical discussion of the reasons behind the solution needs to highlighted clearly.</p>	PASS
Unitel (fictional)	<p><i>General comment</i> Good positioning of the ethical dilemma with a very detailed analysis. Excellent linkage between business and CSR perspective. There is a good reflection behind the ethical solution given and a balance approach to the problem. Less clear instead is the link between the solution and the specific ethical theory explained. Good presentation skills.</p> <p><i>Suggestion for the short essay</i> Think more carefully to the links between the solution offered and the ethical theory that may be in line with it.</p>	EXCELLENT PASS
I&S (fictional)	<p><i>General comment</i> Very specific case probably difficult to expand to other different situations and a more general level. Very detailed and sounded cost/benefit analysis and well-adherent to the ethical dilemma, considering much of the aspects involved also from different stakeholders' perspective. Some concrete evidences taken from the business world.</p> <p><i>Suggestion for the short essay</i> Present the solution also in terms of company policies, but the ethical discussion for the solution is already very good so use it.</p>	EXCELLENT PASS
Tobacco/ Animal tests	<p><i>General comment</i> Long presentation of the history of the product, without a clear necessity of it for the task in question here. The presentation was not related to a company but more on the general ethical issue, i.e. animal testing in the tobacco industry. However, the presentation of the ethical dilemma is well detailed and explained with clear evidence of research on the topic. The ethical discussion is good even if the final solution is more for consumers than for a company. The link of the solution to the ethical theory can be improve. Good reply to the questions.</p> <p><i>Suggestion for the short essay</i> Turn your solution into something workable from a company perspective. What should your company do to apply your solution?</p>	PASS

Mattel	<p><i>General comment</i> The presentation is well detailed and clearly connected to the case presented. However, the solution proposed is only punitive and contingent. Despite it is well discussed how this solution follows the indications of the selected theory, it offers only a solution for the case in analysis. There should be more in terms of policies to be adopted by the company.</p> <p><i>Suggestion for the short essay</i> Generalize your solution and make it as a policy that can be used in the future for similar situations.</p>	PASS
UPS	<p><i>General comment</i> The ethical issue starting from the analysis of contingent case of pregnancy discrimination is then nicely used generalize consequences, solutions and policies to a general level. Very good evidence of research on the topic. Very good presentation of a solution in term of policies and set of reasons behind it. However, it is not completely clear how the solution is connected to the ethical theory selected, especially since you are referring to consequences to justify the solution of a deontological nature.</p> <p><i>Suggestion for the short essay</i> Think more carefully to the links between the solution offered and the ethical theory that may be in line with it.</p>	EXCELLENT PASS
H&M	<p><i>General comment</i> The presentation is fully referenced and the ethical issue is well explained. The solution proposed is sound and reasonable but there is a limited elaboration of ethical concepts and little in term of how the selected ethical theory is applicable in practice. The motivation for the solution suggested is only explained in terms of external stakeholders' perspective but it is necessary a deeper a more comprehensive analysis of all actors involved (the company itself in first place for example)</p> <p><i>Suggestion for the short essay</i> Turn your solution into something workable from a company perspective. Render it a policy that can be something like a code of conduct. Express better the link between the solution and the ethical solution proposed</p>	PASS
J&J	<p><i>General comment</i> The presentation is limited to narrative of a case even if the case is fully explained. The solution offered is only of an operative nature and there is no much ethical discussion behind it, at least as presented. Also, quite limited the presentation skills.</p> <p><i>Suggestion for the short essay</i> You need to discuss clearly the ethical implication of the case and how the solution proposed is adherent to the selected normative ethical theory.</p>	MARGINAL FAIL

Be confident (fictional)	<p><i>General comment</i> The structure of the presentation was not completely clear; however, the ethical issue is presented comprehensively with the comparison of different perspectives. There are some evidences taken from the real business world despite they are not well documented and nor used properly for the presentation of the ethical issue. The ethical discussion is coherent but not so clearly linked to the normative ethical theory.</p> <p><i>Suggestion for the short essay</i> More should be done to link the normative ethical theory to the solution proposed. You should clearly highlight with the use of philosophical concepts how the solutions is in line with it.</p>	PASS
Nespresso	<p><i>General comment</i> Clear presentation fully supported with strong evidence of research processes. Good analysis of the solution with a detailed policy. The solution is strongly operative but more discussion of ethical concepts is needed specially to link clearly the ethical theory to the solution. Good presentation skills and ability to reply to questions.</p> <p><i>Suggestion for the short essay</i> More should be done to link the normative ethical theory to the solution proposed.</p>	EXCELLENT PASS
Epicenter (innovative solutions)	<p><i>General comment</i> The ethical dilemma is well analysed and good evidence of research on the topic. However, the conclusion drawn from such detail process takes into consideration only economic aspects to assess its ethical validity. The solution proposed does not include a broad evaluation of stakeholders' perspectives but is only centred on the company benefit. An ethical evaluation can be associated to economic criteria but what is right is not necessary what is profitable.</p> <p><i>Suggestion for the short essay</i> You should discuss ethical concepts to justify your solution and in doing this also considering more than the company' s perspective only.</p>	PASS
Fed. Insurance (fictional)	<p><i>General comment</i> The ethical dilemma is well presented but as posed in the presentation it may not completely fit with a private sector context. The stakeholder analysis is detailed and comprehensive. There is evidence of research and reflection but the ethical discussion and the justification of the solution should be more supported and elaborated. Some evidence of research process.</p> <p><i>Suggestion for the short essay</i> More should be done to link the normative ethical theory to the solution proposed.</p>	PASS
Ilva	<p><i>General comment</i> The ethical issue is well presented and well structured. The ethical discussion is extremely clear and ethical concepts are used properly.</p>	EXCELLENT

	<p>Good reflection about the solution and the theories involved in that. The discussion is full of evidences coming from the business world. Complete stakeholder analysis. Excellent presentation skills.</p> <p><i>Suggestion for the short essay</i> The solution offered is already well structured you need to assess the link with one (only one) ethical theory.</p>	PASS
<p>Nokia Revised in McDonald's</p>	<p><i>General comment</i> The original presentation of Nokia was not an ethical issue but a business analysis of the decline of the brand. The new presentation is more ethical centred on ethics but there are a set of problems and solutions offered for the same company. It would have been much better to follow the indication and be focused only on one issue and clearly show how the solution is related to the selected theory. Such crowded presentation does not allow for a deep reflection and discussion. Little evidence of research process</p> <p><i>Suggestion for the short essay</i> Focus only on one issue and using ethical and philosophical concepts assess a solution for the problem.</p>	MARGINAL FAIL
<p>Garica (fictional)</p>	<p><i>General comment</i> The case is contingent; an effort needs to be made to suggest a policy that can be general. The structure of the presentation could be improved but there is a good level of research process and reflection. The ethical theory and the comparison of different scenarios is nicely done.</p> <p><i>Suggestion for the short essay</i> Make a more specific solution that can be developed as a policy for the firm and link that to the ethical theory.</p>	PASS

MARGINAL FAIL = $15 < 17$

PASS = $18 < 26$

EXCELLENT PASS = > 26